



**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF  
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Ameritech Ohio requests that the information designated on Attachment A hereto as confidential and/or proprietary and set forth in the accompanying 271 checklist compliance filing (along with any and all copies, including electronic copies) be protected from public disclosure.

Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Commission's rules provides that the Commission or certain designated employees may issue an order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission's Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. As set forth herein, state law prohibits the release of the information which is the subject of this motion. Moreover, the non-disclosure of the information will not impair the purposes of Title 49. The Commission and its Staff have full access to the information in order to fulfill their statutory obligations. No purpose of Title 49 would be served by the public disclosure of the information.

The need to protect the designated information from public disclosure is clear, and there is compelling legal authority supporting the requested protective order. While the Commission has often expressed its preference for open proceedings, the Commission also long ago recognized its statutory obligations with regard to trade secrets:

The Commission is of the opinion that the "public records" statute must also be read in pari materia with Section 1333.31, Revised Code ("trade secrets" statute). The latter statute must be interpreted as evincing the recognition, on the part of the General Assembly, of the value of trade secret information. In re: General Telephone Co., Case No. 81-383-TP-AIR (Entry, February 17, 1982).

Likewise, the Commission has facilitated the protection of trade secrets in its rules (O.A.C. § 4901-1-24(A)(7)).

The definition of a "trade secret" is set forth in the Uniform Trade Secrets Act:

"Trade secret" means information, including the whole or any portion or phase of any scientific or technical information, design, process, procedure, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any business information or plans, financial information, or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

- (1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.
- (2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

R. C. § 1333.61(D). This definition clearly reflects the state policy favoring the protection of trade secrets such as the information which is the subject of this motion.

Courts of other jurisdictions have held that not only does a public utilities commission have the authority to protect the trade secrets of a public utility, the trade secret statute creates a duty to protect them. New York Tel. Co. v. Pub. Serv. Comm. N.Y., 56 N.Y. 2d 213 (1982). Indeed, for the Commission to do otherwise would be to negate the protections the Ohio General Assembly has granted to all businesses, including public utilities, through the Uniform Trade Secrets Act. This Commission has previously carried out its obligations in this regard in numerous proceedings. See, e.g., Elyria Tel. Co., Case No. 89-965-TP-AEC (Finding and Order, September 21, 1989); Ohio Bell Tel. Co., Case No. 89-718-TP-ATA (Finding and Order, May 31, 1989); Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc., Case No. 90-17-GA-GCR (Entry, August 17, 1990).

In 1996, the Ohio General Assembly amended R. C. §§ 4901.12 and 4905.07 in order to facilitate the protection of trade secrets in the Commission's possession. The General Assembly carved out an exception to the general rule in favor of the public disclosure of information in the Commission's possession. By referencing R. C. § 149.43, the Commission-specific statutes now

incorporate the provision of that statute that excepts from the definition of “public record” records the release of which is prohibited by state or federal law. R. C. § 149.43(A)(1). In turn, state law prohibits the release of information meeting the definition of a trade secret. R. C. §§ 1333.61(D) and 1333.62. The amended statutes also reference the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. The protection of trade secret information from public disclosure is consistent with the purposes of Title 49 because the Commission and its Staff have access to the information; in many cases, the parties to a case may have access under an appropriate protective agreement. The protection of trade secret information as requested herein will not impair the Commission’s regulatory responsibilities.

In Pyromatics, Inc. v. Petruziello, 7 Ohio App. 3d 131, 134-135 (Cuyahoga App. 1983), the court of appeals, citing Koch Engineering Co. v. Faulconer, 210 U.S.P.Q. 854, 861 (Kansas 1980), delineated factors to be considered in recognizing a trade secret: (1) The extent to which the information is known outside the business, (2) the extent to which it is known to those inside the business, *i.e.*, by the employees, (3) the precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information, (4) the savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors, (5) the amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information, and (6) the amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information. The Ohio Supreme Court adopted these factors as appropriate in State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Ins., 80 Ohio St. 3d 513 (1997).

For all of the information which is the subject of this motion, Ameritech Ohio believes that the CLECs have treated it as proprietary, confidential business information, and it is available to Ameritech Ohio only pursuant to agreements protecting its confidentiality and

prohibiting its public disclosure. Ameritech Ohio considers and has treated the information as a trade secret. In the ordinary course of business of Ameritech Ohio, this information is stamped confidential, is treated as proprietary and confidential by Ameritech Ohio employees, and is not disclosed to anyone except in a Commission proceeding and/or pursuant to staff data request. During the course of discovery, information of this type has generally been provided only pursuant to protective agreement.

The Attachment to this Memorandum in Support lists the information which has been redacted from the associated filing and further describes why it should be granted protected status. For the foregoing reasons, Ameritech Ohio requests that the designated information be protected from public disclosure.

Respectfully submitted,

AMERITECH OHIO

By: \_\_\_\_\_

Kevin M. Sullivan  
Michael T. Mulcahy  
James F. Lang  
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP  
1400 McDonald Investment Center  
800 Superior Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-2688  
(216) 622-8299  
(216) 241-0816 (fax)

Mary Ryan Fenlon  
Ameritech  
150 E. Gay St., Rm. 4-C  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
(614) 223-7928

Its Attorneys

## **ATTACHMENT**

### **1. Identification of Confidential Information**

Specific individual CLEC service, unbundled network element and collocation quantities and information contained in the Affidavit and Attachments of Deborah Heritage.

Specific individual CLEC information regarding purchases of OS and/or DA contained in Attachment A of Jan D. Rogers.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that a copy of the foregoing Motion was served via regular U.S. mail, postage pre-paid, this 9th day of August, 2001, upon the following:

Sally W. Bloomfield  
Julia L. Dorrian  
Bricker & Eckler, LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291

Terry L. Etter  
Rochelle L. Cavicchia  
Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
Suite 1800  
10 West Broad Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-3485

Pamela H. Sherwood  
Time Warner Telecom of Ohio  
4625 W. 86th Street, Suite 500  
Indianapolis, IN 46268

Joseph P. Serio  
David C. Bergmann  
Yolanda Vorys  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

Thomas W. Hill  
Robert G. Cohen  
Kegler, Brown, Hill & Ritter  
65 East State Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, OH 43215

William S. Newcomb, Jr.  
Stephen M. Howard  
Joseph C. Blasko  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease  
52 East Gay Street  
P.O. Box 1008  
Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Henry T. Kelly  
Michael W. Ward  
O'Keefe, Ashenden, Lyons and Ward  
30 N. LaSalle St., Suite 4100  
Chicago, IL 60602

Benita A. Kahn  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
52 East Gay Street  
PO Box 1008  
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

David J. Chorzempa  
AT&T Corp.  
222 West Adams, Suite 1500  
Chicago, IL 60606

VP Regulatory Midwest  
Time Warner Telecom  
250 W. Old Wilson Bridge Rd., Suite 130  
Worthington, OH 43085

Jeffrey L. Small  
Chester Willcox & Saxbe  
17 South High St., Suite 900  
Columbus, OH 43215

Steve Nourse  
Jodi Bair  
Chief, Public Utilities Section  
180 East Broad St., 7th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215

Roger P. Sugarman  
Leigh A. Reardon  
Kegler, Brown, Hill & Ritter  
65 East State Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, OH 43215

Joseph R. Stewart  
50 W. Broad St., Suite 3600  
Columbus, OH 43215

Lee T. Lauridsen  
Sprint Communications Co., L.P.  
8140 Ward Parkway  
Kansas City, MO 64114

Ruth Holder  
Dow, Lohnes & Albertson  
1200 New Hampshire Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20036

Joseph P. Meissner  
Cleveland Legal Aid Society  
1223 West Sixth Street  
Cleveland, OH 44113

Ellis Jacobs  
Legal Aid Society of Dayton  
333 West First Street, Suite 500  
Dayton, OH 45402

Boyd B. Ferris  
Carlile Patchen & Murphy LLP  
366 East Broad Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Judith Sanders  
Bell, Royer & Sanders Co., LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Douglas Kinkoph  
XO Ohio, Inc.  
Two Easton Oval, Suite 300  
Columbus, OH 43219

Evan Siegel  
MCI WorldCom  
205 N. Michigan Ave., 11th Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60601

Christopher J. Wilson  
Frost & Jacobs  
201 E. 4th Street, Room 102-620  
Cincinnati, OH 45201

Thomas L. Jacobs  
United Telephone Co. of Ohio  
900 Springmill Street  
Mansfield, OH 44906

Nancy Neylon  
Executive Director  
Ohio Domestic Violence Network  
4041 N. High St., Suite 400  
Columbus, OH 43214

Tim Strach  
Dept. of Information and Technology  
Services  
130 W. Second St., Suite 320  
Dayton, OH 45402

William Haas  
Daniel Lipschultz  
McLeodUSA Telecommunications  
Services, Inc.  
400 S. Highway 169, Suite 750  
Minneapolis, MN 55426

Andrew D. Lipman  
Mary C. Albert  
Eric J. Branfman  
Tamar E. Finn  
Swidler, Berlin, Shereff, Friedman LLP  
3000 K St. NW  
Washington, DC 20007-5116

Robert J. Aamoth  
Andrew M. Klein  
Kelley, Drye & Warren L.L.P.  
1200 Nineteenth Street, N.W.  
Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20036

Linda L. Oliver  
Hogan & Hartson L.L.P.  
555 Thirteenth St. NW  
Washington, DC 20004

Barth E. Royer  
Bell, Royer & Sanders Co., LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Michael R. Smalz  
Ohio State Legal Services Association  
861 N. High St.  
Columbus, OH 43215

Christopher Holt  
CoreComm Limited  
110 E. 59 St.  
New York, NY 10022

Mary W. Christensen  
Christensen, Shoemaker, Winkler,  
Howarth & Taylor  
77 East Nationwide Boulevard  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-2539

Howard Siegel  
Vice President-Regulatory Policy  
IP Communications Corp.  
502 West 14<sup>th</sup> Street  
Austin, Texas 78701

John W. Bentine  
Todd M. Rodgers  
Chester, Willcox & Saxbe LLP  
17 S. High Street, Suite 900  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Sheldon A. Taft  
Stephen M. Howard  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease  
52 E. Gay St., P.O. Box 1008  
Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Regulatory Manager  
Scherers Communications Group  
670 Lakeview Plaza Blvd., Ste. A  
Worthington, OH 43085-4783

Thomas J. O'Brien  
Bricker & Eckler, LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291

Glenn Harris  
Itzel D. Berrio  
NorthPoint Communications, Inc.  
303 Second Street, South Tower  
San Francisco, CA 94107

Carol Ann Bischoff  
COMPTTEL  
1900 M Street, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20036